

REPORT
OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
ON THE RESULTS OF THE EVALUATION OF CONFORMITY OF
NAZAR CENTER FOR CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT
LLP TO THE STANDARDS OF INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION OF
ADDITIONAL EDUCATION ORGANIZATIONS (CONTINUING
PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT)

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 49 dated 12.08.2019, an External Expert Commission (EEC) was formed to conduct an institutional accreditation on 28-29.08. 2019 of NAZAR Center for Continuing Professional Development LLP for conformity to the standards of institutional accreditation of additional education organization (continuing professional development) with the following membership:



External Expert Commission Chairman

IBRAEVA GULMIRA ALPYSPAEVNA

Candidate of Medical Science, Associate Professor, Director of Institute of Continuing Education PROFESSIONAL, member of the working group of Committee for Continuing Medical Education of EMA REMB MH RK on the development of LSI and legislative documents in the field of continuing professional education.

tel.: +7 707 8391074, e-mail: inop.kz@mail.ru



National academic expert

DZHAKOVA GULZHANAT ERTAEVNA

Candidate of Medical Science, Dean of the Faculty of Continuing Medical Education of the Pavlodar Branch of Semey Medical University, Independent Accredited Expert, Member of the Association of Independent Experts of Pavlodar Region.

tel+77014711781, e-mail: guljanat74@mail.ru



National academic expert

RAMAZANOVA SHOLPAN KHAMZAEVNA,
Candidate of Medical Science
Head of the Department of Children's Diseases - 3
Asfendiyarov Kazakh National Medical University
NJSC

tel.: +7 701 7995665,

e-mail: sholpan2007@bk.ru



Expert – Representative of employers

KANZHIGALIN MARAT GABDULLOVICH
Chief free-lance combustiologist of Pavlodar
region, Head of the Burns Unit of the MSE on
REM Pavlodar City Hospital No. 1

tel.: +7013175680,

e-mail: comba93@mail.ru



**Expert - representative of healthcare
professionals (trainees)**

SHAMGUNOVA

MARIYAM

KABDYLBAKITOVNA

Cardiologist in MSE on REM Pavlodar Regional
Cardiology Center

tel.: +7 705 521 2818,

e-mail: mariyam8989@mail.ru



ECAQA observer

UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA

Head of Accreditation and Monitoring
Department of Eurasian Center for
Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher
Education and Health Care NPO

tel.: +7 747 5609212,

e-mail: info@ecaqa.org

In the period from 28.08. 2019 to 29.08. 2019, the assessment of conformity of the main activities of NAZAR Center for Continuing Professional Development LLP (hereinafter - the CCPD) to the standards of institutional accreditation of Additional Education Organizations (CPD) of ECAQA was conducted.

The EEC report contains an assessment of the CCPD for compliance with ECAQA institutional accreditation standards, EEC recommendations on further improvement of the implementation of the educational process.

The visit of an External Expert Commission to the CCPD in order to verify the data of the self-assessment report and validate the data onsite was organized in accordance with the program approved by the Director General of the Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality Assurance of Education and Health care (ECAQA) MD, Prof. Sarsenbayeva Saule Sergazievna and agreed with the director of the CCPD Rakhimzhanov Radzhan Baybolatovich “21” 08. 2019.

2. General part of the EEC final report

Introduction of NAZAR Center for Continuing Professional Development LLP

The limited liability partnership NAZAR Center for Continuing Professional Development (hereinafter referred to as the Center), registered in the Department of Justice of Pavlodar on January 27, 2018, acts on the basis of the Charter. The founder is Rakhimzhanov Radzhan Baybolatovich, born in 1986, a native of Pavlodar region. Registration number is 180140036702. The organizational structure includes director, specialists in the organization of the educational process, a specialist in the deployment of methodologist students, teachers and the financial and economic department. Teachers engage on a contractual basis.

CCPD Nazar is open as an independent organization that practices continuing professional development and retraining of nurses and pharmacists, doctors, education of paramedics using standard education programs for continuing professional development and phased implementation of distance technologies.

The relevance for the city and the region of the center opening lies in the need to improve the process of continuing professional development of doctors, the implementation of which contributes to the implementation of the state health development program of the Republic of Kazakhstan “Densaulyk” by Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 15.01.2016 No. 176.

CCPD carries out educational activities in accordance with established state requirements, regulatory and legal acts in the field of continuing professional development, taking into account a flexible and mobile training system for specialists.

The organizational, functional and staff structures of the organization are built with regard to the mission, goals, objectives and policies in the field of ensuring the quality of continuing professional education and guarantee effective management of the educational process and prompt response to the needs of students. The organizational structure of the CCPD is developed on the basis of strategic directions for the center development.

CCPD cooperates with two clinical bases: Branch of RHDM LLP - Pavlodar Railway Hospital from 25.02.2018; MSE on REM Pavlodar Regional Cardiology Center from 01.11.2018.

An agreement with the Pavlodar branch of Republican Scientific and Technical Library JSC dd July 12, 2019 was signed on library and information services and updating of regulatory documents.

Within 14 months of its work, the Center trained 479 CPD students and issued standard certificates.

3. Analysis of the self-assessment report of the NAZAR Center for Continuing Professional Development LLP on compliance with the Standards of institutional accreditation of additional education organization (continuing professional development)

The institutional self-assessment of Nazar CCPD LLP was carried out on the basis of order No. 1 dd April 10, 2019 “On approval of the composition of the working group on preparation for institutional accreditation of additional education organizations (continuing professional development).

The report on the institutional self-assessment of the CCPD for compliance with the standards of institutional accreditation of additional education organizations (continuing professional development) is presented on 93 pages, including appendices. It is characterized by the completeness, structuredness and internal unity of the information provided by the accredited educational organization about its activities, the presence of links to tabular material, stylistically correct. A cover letter signed by director Rakhimzhanov Radzhan Baybolatovich is attached to the report.

The report is made out in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting self-assessment within the institutional accreditation and is fully conform to the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Additional Education Organizations (continuing professional development). There is a list of members of the internal commission for self-assessment, indicating the responsibility of each member of

the internal commission (total - 9 people), information about the representative of the Institution responsible for conducting institutional self-assessment - Rakhimzhanov R.B. The chairman of the working group on preparation for institutional accreditation is Rakhimzhanov R.B., as the director of the accredited organization.

For the period of the self-assessment the working group and the staff of the Institution had done a certain work on the preparation of the report: the necessary information was collected in accordance with the standards of institutional accreditation; a thorough analysis of the materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Institutional Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strong points and areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

The database and applications are presented in full, sequentially and there are links to them in the text of the report. Information on the legal status of NAZAR Center for Continuing Professional Development (Charter (extracts) dated January 27, 2018 is attached to the report; Certificate of State Registration of Legal Entities (BIN 180140036702) registered in the Department of Justice of the Auezov District of the Department of Justice of Almaty dated July 22, 2017; Certificate of State re-registration of a legal entity (BIN 170740024114), Department of Justice of Pavlodar dated January 27, 2018).

The report is written skillfully, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, and the tables contain links in the text and have continuous numbering.

4. Analysis of compliance with the institutional accreditation standards of additional education organizations (continuing professional development) based on the results of an external evaluation of the NAZAR Center for Continuing Professional Development and a review of each standard strong points

Standard 1: Mission and outcomes

Members of the EEC obtained evidence of the *mission* and *vision* of the CCPD, which are available for review for all stakeholders (employees, students, patients) both on the organization's website (<http://www.cppn.kz/>) and at the stands.

Employees, faculty and students of the CCPD, as well as stakeholders (employers, partners) took part in preliminary discussion and development of the mission. Employees of the organization were acquainted with the mission on conferences and meetings. The mission is displayed on the organization's board, in classrooms, on the website, in syllabuses, memos, social networks (Facebook, Instagram).

Students' educational outcomes are reflected in the specialty working training programs. This fact was established when studying the results of students' survey upon completion of continuing education programs.

Cycle of advanced training and retraining allows implementing a competency-based approach to training by creating the necessary conditions for this, aimed at the formation, development and personal professional becoming on the basis of national and universal values, achievements of science and practice.

Experts were convinced that the CCPD is one of the respected and highly-demanded organizations of continuing education for different categories of students. And the professionalism of healthcare specialists is the basis of the strategic goals and objectives of the Nazar CCPD.

Strong points:

1) A stable organizational and managerial structure and sufficient material and technical base, corresponding to the mission, vision, goals and objectives of the Center.

2) An effective training system that meets the needs of healthcare professionals and non-medical workers.

3) Clinical bases, well equipped with MTB for the development and evaluation of students' practical skills.

4) Free access to modern professional and educational literature on electronic media or on the website of the center (<http://www.cppn.kz/>).

5) CPD is provided by faculty members with the degree of Doctor or Candidate of Science, academic degree of Doctor or Master of Philosophy, as well as practicing doctors of the highest and first category.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 13, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 1: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement:

1) The mission does not fully clear up the role of this organization.

2) Lack of teaching staff, due to the remoteness of the Center from the regions where universities and research institutes are located.

3) The insufficient involvement of the Center's teachers in research activities and, as a result, the lack of publications in international peer-reviewed publications and international patents.

4) Lack of international cooperation.

5) Expected education outcomes that are relevant to the needs of medical staff, patients, and society are not adequately described.

Standard 2: Educational programs

The experts determined that the implementation of additional education programs is carried out in accordance with the regulatory legal acts for continuing education. Working training programs are developed on the basis of the Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 14, 2017 No. 165 "On approval of the Model programs for advanced training and retraining of medical and pharmaceutical personnel.

In accordance with the Rules for Advanced Training and Retraining of Medical and Pharmaceutical Personnel, according to the results of the final control,

those who have mastered the program received: upon completion of the retraining cycles - a certificate of retraining, advanced training - a certificate of advanced training.

A training agenda is compiled for each cycle and it is approved by the director of the Nazar CCPD a week before the start of the cycle. After the end of the cycles, a meeting or conference is held to summarize the learning outcomes, to study the assessment of the students' satisfaction with the quality of the training and retraining cycles.

The center organized and conducted training in 15 medical specialties of specialists with higher and secondary education. The Center has developed teaching materials. The implementation of continuing education programs is carried out off-the-job, on-the-job and partial off-the-job. The educational process combines full-time classes and independent work of students. Orientation of the program to a competent model of advanced training presupposes an active approach, which is achieved through the use of modern educational technologies and interactive forms of training: work in small groups, educational games, feedback, discussion of complex and debatable issues and problems, and a round table.

The requirements of professional associations and practical healthcare applications for the quality of additional training of a healthcare specialist are taken into account when developing educational programs.

The experts made sure that the educational programs of the CCPD contain elements of professional training of specialists and are aimed at the formation and development of scientific concepts and methods, evidence-based medicine, knowledge and skills in the field of clinical disciplines; development of clinical thinking, skills of effective interaction and development of leadership qualities.

During the visit, the experts obtained evidence of the effective implementation of educational programs and the methodological support of the educational process, the availability of internal regulatory documents governing the organization of the educational process. CCPD has the necessary material and technical support for conducting various forms of training. At the departments in all disciplines, teaching materials on paper and electronic media have been developed. Various active teaching methods are used in the CCPD: a multidisciplinary approach, a round table, discussions, debates, solving situational problems, working in pairs, presentations, business games, working in small groups, brainstorming, problem-oriented learning.

The experts attended several practical classes, studied the teaching materials, which made it possible to validate this standard.

CCPD teachers participate in research and implement the results in educational programs and teaching methods. When interviewing students, it was found that they are satisfied with the studying at the CCPD. CCPD supports educational communication through social networks (Facebook, Instagram, Watsup, Skype), thereby stimulating colleagues to transfer new knowledge to each other and receive feedback, to summarize when writing reports.

Students learn about the levels of evidence in medicine, which databases are better to use, and information retrieval skills.

Control in the form of students' questionnaires, registering complaints on the website, in the complaints and suggestions book, which is accessible to all employees, and comments left by students in the Instagram of the training center is carried out to monitor teachers' compliance with the ethical standards and behavior. Over the past period, there have been no cases of violation of ethical standards by the teaching staff in relation to students and between colleagues.

The Center has not concluded agreements with international associations or organizations. In February 2019, the Director of the Nazar CCPD passed BLS provider courses in Nur-Sultan at the Parasat ESIC KMI. Given the relevance of training BLS instructors in the plans of the center, cooperation with the European Resuscitation Association (official representative in Moscow of Arctic Medical Training LLC) in order to train more full instruction BLS employees.

Strong points:

1) Formation of the educational program in accordance with regulatory requirements and demand for staff training.

2) A high level of professionalism of teachers, ensuring the quality of students' training.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 16, partially fulfilled - 3, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 2: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement:

1) Incomplete use of new information computer technologies.

2) Improving the training base in accordance with the requirements.

3) Strengthening the integration of education, science and practice.

4) Inadequate description of educational programs in popular specialties.

Standard 3: Assessment and documentation

Assessment of students' academic achievements is carried out using criteria, regulations and procedures developed in accordance with the goals and objectives of the CCPD in accordance with state directive and internal regulatory documents.

EEC was convinced that the CCPD ensured transparency of the entire educational process and knowledge control system and provided the student with a wide range of educational services, applying modern educational technologies in training and ensuring continuous control of the quality of education.

Monitoring of transparency of the mechanism for assessing learning outcomes is reflected in the "Regulation on the educational process" and is carried out through a survey of students. To determine the level of knowledge, skills and abilities of students of PR and AT courses, as well as to control the digestion of educational material, current and final control of knowledge is carried out using modern evaluation methods. The form of control is determined by the teachers themselves.

External experts made sure that the knowledge of the CCPD students is assessed through the use of various types of test tasks. This type of assessment is used both in the current monitoring of progress, and in the final.

A portfolio is formed for each student throughout the entire period of study, which corresponds to the end goals of the program and contains uniform reliable and valid criteria for evaluating the student's progress. A syllabus is being developed for students of PR and AT courses, which includes information on the assessment policy, the timing of examinations, criteria for passing exams, the possibility of passing the exam again in case of unsatisfactory evaluation in the exam. At the Nazar CCPD, students are given the free access to the results of the entering, intermediate and final control of knowledge and skills. After completing the course, teaching staff provide the results of the final control. On the basis of this and other required aspects (payment, provision of documents), documents on the taking the course are issued. Attendance monitoring is carried out in the attendance and progress journals of students of the theoretical and practical training courses. If there are more than 30% of absences without a good reason, the student can be expelled. The expulsion of students is based on the order of the director.

Strong points:

- 1) Compliance of the educational process with the requirements of the LSI.
- 2) The application of principles and methods for assessing theoretical knowledge and practical knowledge and skills that contributes to integrated training and involvement in the educational process as teachers of doctors with the highest and first qualification category, academic degree.
- 3) Monitoring of student progress and attendance in order to adjust the course schedule.
- 4) Free access for students to the results of the entering, intermediate and final knowledge control

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 3, partially fulfilled - 4, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 3: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To improve the monitoring system of the educational process.
- 2) To develop methodological manuals for test tasks for entering and final control.
- 3) To introduce electronic testing of students.

Standard 4: Healthcare professionals (personal professional development)

EEC experts have received evidence that the CCPD carries out educational activities in accordance with established state requirements, regulatory and legal acts in the field of additional professional education, taking into account a flexible and mobile system of training for healthcare professionals.

The Center monthly sends training cycle plans, newsletters to regional and city health departments, medical organizations, and private centers. A database of e-mail addresses and numbers of chief and senior nurses, department heads, heads of personnel departments and reception of chief physicians of medical organizations has been created. Health care professionals make the decision to study on their own, voluntarily choosing a training organization.

Since the Center establishment, students have been trained: 2018 - 107; 2019 -372. Total - 479 listeners. This quantitative indicator reflects the high demand of the Center among healthcare specialists and the tendency to increase the Center's capabilities in the educational services market in the CPD system. In the context of specialties, data are displayed in an electronic archive for the entire training period. Training on continuing education courses is carried out for specialists who have previously received professional education in the main specialty and (or) who have passed professional retraining in this specialty, occupying positions corresponding to the specialty in which advanced training is carried out.

CPD is carried out in accordance with the mission of the center in order to meet the educational needs of students and is implemented in the form of advanced training and retraining. The educational process of the center is aimed at improving and (or) obtaining new competencies necessary for professional activities, and (or) improving the professional level within an existing specialty.

As stimulation for students, reward schemes have been developed for involvement in various advanced training programs, training seminars, short-term modules that are implemented according to the profile of the specialty. For example: students who most often participated in the organization's activities, in 2019 5 nurses and 5 doctors underwent a free course of basic cardiopulmonary resuscitation at the cardiology center. Teaching staff receive a decent salary, as part of the remuneration, teachers can get a AT at a discount, be sent to training at the expense of the organization. Faculty receives updated materials, technical support. The policy of encouraging listeners and teaching staff is regularized in the regulation on the organization of additional education Nazar CCPD.

Strong points:

- 1) Ongoing consultation support of students, including individual.
- 2) Implementation of a reward system for both students and faculty.
- 3) Transparency of the selection process and equal access to additional education.
- 4) A flexible procedure for recruiting groups from small 2-3 people to 10.
- 5) The introduction of new pedagogical technologies in the process of training students.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 16, partially fulfilled - 1, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 4: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) Active inclusion of students in the deliberative body of the Center to improve the educational process.

Standard 5: Provision of supplementary education (continuous professional development)

The CCPD has demonstrated its desire to meet all regulatory (orders, regulations, rules, qualification requirements, methodological support) requirements in the field of supplementary education, including the passage of the relevant procedures for recognizing the institute as an organization of additional education. For objectivity and collegial decision-making on CPD programs, a methodological committee functions in the CCPD.

The experts were convinced that the CCPD regularly evaluates and reviews programs with the participation of students, employees and other stakeholders based on the systematic collection, analysis and management of information, as a result of which the programs are adapted to ensure their relevance.

The qualifications of teachers are confirmed by relevant diplomas of higher education, academic degree, academic rank. Also, the teaching staff qualification is confirmed by standard certificates, professional experience in the relevant specialty, and is provided by monitoring the responsibilities of teachers of all disciplines of the educational program. The teaching staff of the Nazar CCPD is presented by: candidates of medical sciences - 4, incl. with the academic title "Associate Professor" - 2, masters of medical sciences - 3, doctors with the highest category - 6, with the first category - 2. The total number of employees involved in teaching is 16, which at this stage is sufficient to implement the syllabus for CPD.

The policy of the Nazar CCPD in the field of professional development of personnel is called upon to provide favorable conditions for the growth of competencies and advanced training of employees necessary for the implementation of strategic goals and objectives, in accordance with the mission of the Nazar CCPD. All PR and AT programs are developed in accordance with state requirements for additional education.

When assessing the quality of teaching, the opinion of students through questionnaires is of great importance, since it is the students who work throughout the cycle in close contact with the teacher and evaluate the quality of the educational process. Taking into account the analysis of the students' questionnaire, the leaders of the center and the teacher can improve the quality of teaching, which is important for effective management of the educational process. Studying the opinions of students and visitors of the Center is also carried out through entries in the "Book of complaints and suggestions". A total number of reviews is 12 and all positive, there were no conflict situations.

Professional Associations invite Center staff to participate in forums and conferences. Lecturer Candidate of Medical Science Baygaliev A.A., in November 2018 participated in an international scientific conference in the city of Przemysl, Poland.

Cooperation with medical universities (faculties) is not carried out in connection with competition in the market of continuing education services. The center provides paid training based on requests from individuals and applications from medical organizations.

Strong points:

- 1) A sufficiently high professional potential of teachers (share with academic degrees, first and highest qualification categories);
- 2) The demand for the Center among medical organizations and the financing of orders for training its employees.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 10, partially fulfilled - 2, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 5: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) Further improvement of the teacher motivation system.
- 2) Creation of conditions for cooperation with medical universities.

Standard 6: Educational resources

CCPD has a developed material and technical base for training students, which meets the qualification requirements, compliance with which is monitored by the director.

The Center has an electronic database of a scientific medical library; a card index of this literature has been created where a full and operational library and information-bibliographic service of medical personnel, students, teachers, and other employees of the training center is carried out. In addition, students of the training center have access to a scientific library providing information resources in English, Russian and Kazakh, access to educational resources, to the database of international medical libraries, etc. (section "Science"), website: <http://nnch.kz>

There is access to international databases. From medical information resources - these are abstract versions of PubMed, Medline Complete, Clinical Key, Cochrane Library. Educational resources and services are intended for the educational and research process of students, teachers and employees.

The Center concluded three cooperation agreements with: Branch of RHDM LLP - Pavlodar Railway Hospital dd 25.02.2018 No.1; MSE on REM Pavlodar Regional Cardiology Center dd 01.11.2018 No.2; Pavlodar branch of the Republican Scientific and Technical Library dd 12.07.2019. The Center ensures the involvement of teachers in the process of continuous monitoring of the Center's innovative activity, facilitates the use of the latest data on the results of clinical trials in medical practice in training, and improves the medical workers clinical training system. Participation in international events, including conferences is in the strategic plan of the Nazar CCPD.

Strong points:

1) To develop clinical skills, students have the opportunity to be trained in departments of various profiles in accordance with the topics of practical classes and those competencies that are defined in the educational program.

2) Information and communication technologies, including Internet resources, access to international databases of scientific and educational literature are actively used in the implementation of the educational program.

3) Compliance with the principles of ethical conduct by employees in their professional activities.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 17, partially fulfilled - 4, not fulfilled - 2

Standard 6: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To promote regional and international exchange of teachers and students.
- 2) To develop international cooperation in additional education.
- 3) The wider use of IT technologies in the organization of training and the introduction of distance technology elements in CPD programs.
- 4) To search for forms and methods of cooperation with medical education organizations (universities) to attract teachers and improve CPD programs.

Standard 7: Evaluation of supplementary education programs (continuing professional development)

Development and evaluation of educational programs is carried out taking into account the requirements of regulatory documents of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. CCPD defined the structure and algorithm of the mechanism for monitoring retraining and continuing education programs. After each cycle, they get feedback from students and their recommendations serve as the basis for improving programs.

The system for evaluating educational programs is represented by an internal (questionnaire, feedback, discussion at a meeting of the EMB) and an external assessment (review). The examination, monitoring and improvement of curricula are carried out by the EMB, consisting of teachers and administrative staff.

Strong points:

- 1) The educational process includes interactive teaching methods: discussions, brainstorming, role plays, trainings, discussion of video films, joint solution of issues in solving situational problems.
- 2) Students are given the opportunity during the training to draw logical conclusions, adapt the content to their own practice and test the acquired skills in the conditions of classroom practical classes and extracurricular independent work.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 10, partially fulfilled - 3, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 7: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To improve the monitoring program of the educational process quality.
- 2) To strengthen the monitoring of the quality of educational activities conducted at the clinical bases of the Center.

Standard 8. Organization

External experts studied the organizational structure and in the process of conducting an interview with management and responsible employees, evidence of

the presence of effective and efficient management of key areas of work and the organization of the educational process was obtained. The management's activities regarding the fulfillment of the mission and solving the tasks set for the CCPD are studied and evaluated based on the analysis and making of reports and plans, analysis of the implementation of the goals and objectives of the strategic plan, annual plan, reports. An effective deliberative body of management and decision-making is the EMB.

The competencies of the Center's governing bodies are determined by the charter and internal regulatory documents (job descriptions, Regulations). In accordance with standard documents, the following provisions have been developed: "Regulation on the organization of continuing education", "Regulation on the organization of the educational process", "Regulation on the EMB of the training center", "Rules of the internal labor regulations".

The leadership of the Nazar CCPD is responsible for the organization and support of the educational process of students, control of educational and methodological support of educational programs. Budgeting includes revenue and expenditure bases. Since 2018, revenue in absolute terms has increased by 20%. The analysis shows that the largest share is made up of labor costs.

Paid services are provided on the basis of an approved price list. Salaries are paid according to the staffing list approved by the founder.

Strong points:

- 1) The focus of activities is mainly on medical organizations.
- 2) Responsibilities and obligations regarding the management of the educational program are defined.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 8, partially fulfilled - 1, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 8: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) More efficient use of information and communication technologies in the management system;
- 2) Improving the mechanisms of financing additional education;

Standard 9: Continuous renewal

EEC in the process of observation and conversations with employees, students, teachers, representatives of practical health care, made sure that the CCPD periodically reviews the organizational structure, strategic plan, program content, learning outcomes, assessment methods and resources.

The needs of practical health care, the opinion of representatives of professional associations, the introduction of new regulatory documents in health care and further education are taking into account.

The CCPD leadership allocates all the necessary resources for the continuous improvement of continuing education programs, including human resources (a sufficient number of employees), materiel and technical support, and fair wages for employees and teachers. Discussion of additions and changes to

educational programs based on the analysis of recommendations and suggestions of final exams, requests of healthcare organizations, proposals of teaching staff, with the regard to current trends in medicine and science.

The management system of the Nazar training center is based on a value-oriented management structure that can ensure the achievement of the main goal of the educational institution - the implementation of educational programs in the context of continuous changes.

When making adjustments and updating of educational programs of additional training, teaching staff and employees of the organization use retrospective analysis, a study of literature, LSI, and clinical protocols.

A mandatory requirement of the organization for teaching staff is a constant study of materials from the WHO website and constant cooperation with specialists of medical organizations. When introducing new teaching methods, a survey, questioning of health professionals and teachers is conducted. This process is discussed and approved through the EMB with the involvement of the necessary specialists.

Strong points: no

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 4, partially fulfilled - 2, not fulfilled - 0

Standard 9: accomplished

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To improve the material and technical base of the Nazar training center for development and compliance with requirements;
- 2) To promote the participation of students in scientific and technical programs and scientific publications;
- 3) To improve training through research, development and implementation of new methods of diagnosis and treatment.

5. Recommendations for improving NAZAR Center for Continuing Professional Development activities:

1. To improve the educational process monitoring system.
2. To develop methodological manuals for test tasks for entering and final control.
3. To introduce electronic testing of students.
4. To actively include students in the deliberative body of the Center to improve the educational process.
5. To develop international cooperation in further education.
6. To strengthen monitoring of the quality of educational activities conducted at the clinical bases of the Center.
7. To effectively use information and communication technologies
8. To improve the incentive system of teachers.
9. To search for forms and methods of cooperation with medical education organizations (universities) to attract teachers and improve CPD programs.

10. To improve the material and technical base of the Nazar training center for development and compliance with requirements.

6. Recommendation to the Accreditation Council of ECAQA

Based on the results of an expert assessment of the conformity of all the activities of NAZAR Center for Continuing Professional Development LLP to the Standards of institutional accreditation of the organization of additional education (continuous professional development) developed by ECAQA, the members of the EEC reached common ground to recommend the Accreditation Council of ECAQA to accredit the **NAZAR Center for Continuing Professional Development LLP** for a period of 5 years.

External Expert Commission Chairman	Ibraeva Gulmira Alpispayeva	_____
National academic expert	Dzhakova Gulzhanat Ertaevna	_____
National academic expert	Ramazanova Sholpan Khamzaevna	_____
Expert – representative of the employers	Kanzhigalin Marat Gabdullovich	_____
Expert – representative of healthcare professionals (trainees)	Shamgunova Mariyam Kabdylbakitovna	_____
ECAQA observer	Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna	_____

7. Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

По итогам экспертной оценки соответствия всех направлений деятельности ТОО Центр переподготовки и повышения Квалификации «НАЗАР» Стандартам институциональной аккредитации организаций дополнительного образования (непрерывное профессиональное развитие), разработанными ЕЦА, члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА аккредитовать **ТОО Центр переподготовки и повышения Квалификации «НАЗАР»** на период

5.

**Председатель Внешней
экспертной комиссии**

Ибраева Гульмира
Алписпаевна



**Национальный
академический эксперт**

Джакова Гульжанат
Ертаевна



**Национальный
академический эксперт**

Рамазанова Шолпан
Хамзаевна



**Эксперт – представитель
работодателей**

Канжигалин Марат
Габдуллоевич



**Эксперт – представитель
специалистов
здравоохранения
(слушателей)**

Шамгунова Мариям
Кабдылбакиевна



Наблюдатель от ЕЦА

Умарова Макпал
Альдибековна



Appendix 1.

Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of NAZAR Center for Continuing Professional Development for conformity to the standards of institutional accreditation of the organization of additional education (continuous professional development)

Standard	Assessment criteria	Evaluation		
		Fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Not fulfilled
1.	Mission and outcomes	13	0	0
2.	Educational program	16	3	0
3.	Assessment and documentation	6	1	0
4.	Postgraduate education students and healthcare professionals	19	0	0
5.	Provision of postgraduate and supplementary education (continuous professional development)	12	0	0
6.	Educational resources	21	3	0
7.	Evaluation of postgraduate and supplementary education programs (continuous professional development)	10	1	0
8.	Organization	8	1	0
9.	Continuous renewal	5	0	0
	Total	110	9	0